



## WHO KILLED JUSTIN SMITH?

**Justin Smith**, age 19, was dead on arrival. Several fraternity members concerned by his unconscious vomiting, drove him to the emergency room at 2:30 a.m. But even before they pulled into the emergency drive, his breathing had stopped. Successive attempts by the hospital staff to revive him failed.

The brothers of **Zeta Delta chapter of Pi Kappa Phi fraternity** were sorry. He had lived in the chapter house for two months. Many of the brothers commented about how much he could drink and more than a few had escorted/carried him home from past parties and accompanied him as he threw up. This night seemed like any other.

**Christian**, the Warden, was sorry. Christian decided to have a pledge event with a quiz and lineup that night with some alcohol. Each pledge was escorted to the basement of the fraternity house. The chapter had successfully dodged Pi Kappa Phi's Risk Management Policy all year. Besides, all the pledges wanted to participate. No one else on campus was following their policy, so why should they? If they didn't provide alcohol to their pledges, they would see if they could "handle" alcohol and be a responsible brother.

**Chase**, a pledge brother, sitting next to Justin, was sorry. Nobody ever told him not to pass the bottle to his pledge brother if he was already clearly intoxicated. Justin didn't look any drunker than anyone else at the pledge event. He was having trouble answering questions asked by the brothers, but no more than his other pledge brothers were having.

**Tyler**, the Archon, was sorry. He didn't realize that such activities were going on in the basement of the chapter house. He trusted the Warden and expected the chapter to follow proper procedures for a safe and successful pledge period. While he had participated in lineups as a pledge, he thought that was over. Tyler felt bad for not supervising all pledging activities.

**Scott**, his big brother, was sorry. Family drinks were important to keeping the family united and he had given Justin a fifth of whiskey earlier in the evening before the lineup. He had not told him to drink it.

**Lori**, his girlfriend, was sorry. Justin had been confiding in her all semester about the activities he was being asked to participate in. She had thought about calling his parents or contacting the Director of Fraternity Life on the campus, but had not done it based on Justin urging her that everything was OK.

The **IFC** was sorry. They adopted the FIPG Policy – with provisions similar to those of Pi Kappa Phi's Risk Management Policy – the year before and hosted a hazing speaker a few weeks prior to Justin's death.

Justin's **parents** were sorry. He started drinking during his sophomore year of high school. They knew he had been hazed as part of this high school football team but didn't think it was a big deal. Justin's dad had been hazed when he was joining a fraternity in college. But, what could parents do when they were 200 miles away?

**Who was to blame for the death of Justin Smith?**

Rank the nine in order from most responsible (1) to least responsible (9).

- 1. \_\_\_\_\_
- 2. \_\_\_\_\_
- 3. \_\_\_\_\_
- 4. \_\_\_\_\_
- 5. \_\_\_\_\_
- 6. \_\_\_\_\_
- 7. \_\_\_\_\_
- 8. \_\_\_\_\_
- 9. \_\_\_\_\_

**How was bystander behavior involved in this scenario? Who could have intervened?**

**What risk management rules did the chapter violate in this scenario?**

**What could the chapter have done to reduce their risk in this situation?**